

Interactive comment on “Long-term weather, hydrometric, and water chemistry datasets in high-temporal resolution at the La Salle River watershed in Manitoba, Canada” by Marcos R. C. Cordeiro et al.

C. DeBeer (Editor)

chris.debeer@usask.ca

Received and published: 15 November 2017

The authors have responded to the comments and concerns of three reviewers and have prepared a revised manuscript. Reviewer #3 states that the dataset presented here does not warrant publication based on the aim of this journal (publication of original research data, furthering the reuse of high-quality data of benefit to Earth system sciences) and the review criteria (Is the data set complete? Are the accuracy, calibration, processing, etc. state of the art?). Although the authors argue against this and suggest that the dataset is highly valuable to further understanding of hydrology

and nutrient transport in the region, I must agree with this reviewer and do not see a compelling case that this dataset offers broad scientific value beyond the researcher's own need for a gap-filled dataset to run a hydrological model in this particular basin. There are many problematic issues that are not well addressed in the response to the reviewer's concerns. Some key issues are that the adjusted precipitation dataset by ECCO was not used, and that there are significant gaps in the data that were filled, in some cases using crude techniques and/or other observations from distant locations, thus compromising the value of the data. The meteorological and hydrometric data are not original research data but are taken from readily available online sources, while only the stream chemistry data are novel. In the end I feel that the chemistry data on their own are not sufficient and that the problems and limitations expressed by reviewer #3 cannot be overcome to warrant publication in this journal.

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2017-57>, 2017.

[Printer-friendly version](#)[Discussion paper](#)