

Interactive comment on “Carbon Emissions and Removals by Forests: New Estimates 1990–2020” **by Francesco N. Tubiello**

Jenny Wong

jwong@unfccc.int

Received and published: 29 October 2020

Line 109 "were summarized by UNFCCC annex," What is this "UNFCCC annex"?

Line 155 "with very large uncertainty (about 70% as discussed)," As discussed where?

Line 130 Asia was the third region in terms of deforestation emissions, with decreasing trends since 2010, i.e., from 0.6 Gt CO₂ yr⁻¹ (2011-2015) to 0.4 Gt CO₂ yr⁻¹ (2016-2020) "Since 2010" would mean that there was also a decreasing trend in the period 2011-2015, and with further decrease in 2016-2020. So what were the emissions in 2005-2010, that could indicate this decreasing trend "since 2010"?

Actually the use of the different periods to compare and show trends is rather confusing. At one point, you are comparing 2011-2015 to 2016-2020, then at another point,

C1

you are comparing 1991-2010 or using a timeframe of 1990-2020. If the purpose is to compare or show what has changed between FRA 2015 and FRA 2020, this is rather confusing.

Line 152 Answers what I noted above, but I had to read all the way down before I come to this as one of the purposes of this paper: By combining information on the two periods 2011-2015 and 2016-2020 to obtain for the first time a picture of the 2011-2020 decade, it follows that in 2011-2020 the net contribution of forests to the atmosphere were virtually zero (less than 200 Mt CO₂ yr⁻¹),

But the above still doesn't make clear to me the different time frames compared as noted above.

Line 224 For Indonesia, the new FAO estimates (as well as those based on the FRA 2015) had greatly overestimated country reported data for 1991-2000, i.e., by factors of over 10.

I understand you are comparing estimates reported to the FAO with estimates derived from the GHG inventory to the BUR? Aren't FAO estimates also country reported? So it is unclear in the 2nd line when you refer to country reported data (to whom, to where?)

Interactive comment on Earth Syst. Sci. Data Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/essd-2020-203>, 2020.

C2