Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2018-343-RC1, 2018 

© Author(s) 2018. This work is distributed under the Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 License.



## **HESSD**

Interactive comment

## Interactive comment on "A New Approach for Rainfall Rate Field Space-Time Interpolation for Western Europe" by Guangguang Yang et al.

G. Pegram (Referee)

pegram@ukzn.ac.za

Received and published: 24 August 2018

Yang: hess-2018-343

This paper contains passages from the lead author's PhD thesis submitted in 2016, in which there are references to 3 of his articles, co-authored with his supervisors. One article was a conference abstract and after a web-search it appears that the other two have not been accepted for publication by the IEEE, Radio Science, nor any other journal. I read the thesis through so I could be properly informed and found that the content of this article has been sourced from it almost without alteration. The figures in the article are the same as the thesis, but have been copied several times and are blurred and illegible. In addition, it is important to note that the thesis was aimed at

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper



the field of signal processing, and in my opinion does not have a home in hydrology. My reasons are that maps of parameters of the censored lognormal distribution, fitted to a range of spatial and temporal intervals, but taking no notice of seasonality, may be interesting for electronic engineers checking attenuation of transmission veracity, but they are presumably looking for average, not particular temporal behaviour as is needed in hydrological work.

I recommend rejection.

Geoff Pegram 24 August 2018

Interactive comment on Hydrol. Earth Syst. Sci. Discuss., https://doi.org/10.5194/hess-2018-343, 2018.

## **HESSD**

Interactive comment

Printer-friendly version

Discussion paper

